



JOFA Journal

A publication of the
Jewish Orthodox
Feminist Alliance

Volume II, Issue 2

Summer 2000 — Tammuz 5760

Bruchot Ha'baot

Below are practices that some Orthodox synagogues have introduced to make women feel more welcome:

- When the *sefer Torah* is being carried around the synagogue, it is carried to the women's section. Indeed, in some synagogues, the Torah is given to a woman to carry through the *ezrat nashim* (women's section).
- A woman recites *birkat gomel* (blessing of thanksgiving) from the *ezrat nashim*, and the entire congregation responds.
- Women mourners recite *kaddish*.
- Many synagogues have included the *imahot* (matriarchs) in the *Mi Sheberach* prayer for the sick and in other prayers such as the blessing for the soldiers.
- Women serve on ritual committees, synagogue boards, as officers of the congregation and as synagogue presidents.
- Pre Bat Mitzvah girls lead *Ein Kelohanu*, *Aleinu* and *Adon Olam*.
- Women recite *kiddush* and *hamotzi* at communal meals in the synagogue.
- Women give introductory talks before Torah and *Haftorah* readings.
- Both mother and father of a Bar Mitzvah recite the *Baruch Sheptarani* prayer.
- Women give sermons and lectures in the synagogue on Shabbat morning.
- On *Simchat Torah*, the verses of *Ata Hareta* are alternated between men and women.
- At a *brit* women have participated by holding the baby for the *brit* or the naming. The new moth-

Continued on page 2

From Our President Bless this Holy Congregation...



By Blu Greenberg

On the one hand, the *tzedaka* box isn't passed to the three women present at the daily *minyan*; and the new Chabad *siddur* deletes altogether the woman's blessing *she'asani kirtzono*; and the rabbi names the infant girl in synagogue omitting her mother's name; and the new sign on the door reads "women should refrain from using the front entrance but should enter the synagogue through the side door; and the 12 year old girls gab in the powder room during *mussaf*; and the rabbi asks the 20 women who arrived early for the *bris* to *daaven* in the vestibule because two guest rabbis complained the *mechitza* (divider) isn't high enough, and the local women decide to make no fuss for fear the rabbi will ask the board to raise the *mechitza* so that "all" Jews can *daaven* in his *shul*; and the congregation attacks the rabbi for his *halakhic* ruling that the *sefer Torah* may be carried through the women's section...

On the other hand, the woman honoring her *aliyah* (emigration) to Israel with a parting *kiddush* (collation) recites *kiddush* for the entire congregation; and the Sisterhood is consulted so that the *mechitza* is built with equal sight lines; and women scholars are invited to teach Torah from the pulpit; and the *eruv* becomes a priority because the town leaders know the it will bring the young families; and the rabbi is careful to include "she" with every "he", and say "men" and

not "everyone" when speaking of *tefillin* (phylacteries); and the growing numbers of women reciting *kaddish* (mourner's prayer) find the welcome mat out for them; and the women's section is filled *leil Shabbat* (Shabbat evening); and the mother's name is included as her *bar mitzvah* recites his *aliyah* blessing; and the little girls are called to open the ark for *anim zemirot*, and in some places, to lead *adon olam*....

Clearly, we are in a transitional state. At the Union of Orthodox Jewish Congregations Rabbinic Awards dinner last March, most of the 13 honorees mentioned women's issues as critical to their congregational work. While women's learning is no longer an "issue" — with learned and learning women now accepted as a treasured community asset — women's role in the synagogue remains a source of confusion, exhilaration or frustration — all signs of a community in flux.

There is a great deal of sorting out to do, and one task is simply to frame the questions:

What is women's role in *tefila be'tzibbur* (public prayer), the question addressed below in this issue? Can you be thought of as "guest" yet still immerse yourself totally in congregational prayer? Can the issue of *tzibbur* be dealt with without getting into matters of *biyyuv* (obligation) and *minyan*, responsibility and accountability? Can *mechitza* serve as paradigm for distinctive but equal roles? If so, what are the new *halakhic* standards for compliance so that *mechitza* engenders a sense of equality?

Continued on page 6

Letters to the Editor

I was interested in your article about women in leadership positions [JOFA Journal, Winter, 2000], especially since I am the president of Adas Kodesch Shel Emeth, the oldest synagogue in Delaware. It is a traditional synagogue with an Orthodox rabbi, an Orthodox service and an active Women's Tefillah Group. About half the board members are women.

I am the first woman president of the board in the synagogue's 115-year history. Overall, the response of the congregation to this new "look" has been extremely favorable, and I have had a great deal of support. As is the case with other women in our synagogue, I speak,

make presentations, give *Divrei Torah* (sermons), welcome groups who come and always do the announcements on Shabbat, all from the *bimah*. However, unlike all of my (male) predecessors, I do not sit on the *bimah* during services. The seat usually occupied by the president of the congregation remains empty.

I knew the rules going in. I decided the trade-off was worth it. Breaking the psychological barrier to women taking the top lay leader-

Breaking the psychological barrier to women taking the top lay leadership position seemed more important than a seat on the bimah.

ship position seemed more important than a seat on the *bimah*. Frankly, someday, I would like to see a woman sit on the *bimah* in the rabbi's seat.

I have made some interesting discoveries. First, the empty seat is more disturbing to the women and girls of the congregation than I would have anticipated and continues to cause comment, even during

the third year of my tenure. The issues of "modesty and chastity" do not seem to make sense when they are attached to a particular woman in this specific context, rather than in the abstract. I would like to be given a choice, but, at this point, my choice would be to sit in the congregation. I find I like being part of the *kahal* (congregation), being accessible and having the same view of the service as the rest of the congregation. Sitting on the *bimah* when you have no function in the service now seems a bit arrogant to me.

I would go one step further. Wouldn't it be interesting for the clergy to sit sometimes in the congregation? What might they discover about the service, about their congregants, about their own relationship to prayer, about modesty?

Sincerely,
Harriet Ainbinder
Wilmington, DE

Letters to the Editor should be emailed to jofa@rcn.com or faxed to (212) 753-6054. They may also be mailed to: JOFA, 459 Columbus Avenue, Suite 329, New York, NY 10024. Letters may be edited due to space considerations.

JOFA Journal

A publication of the
Jewish Orthodox Feminist Alliance
Volume II, Issue 2
Summer 2000 - Tammuz 5760

President: Blu Greenberg

Editorial Board:

Esther Farber, Chairperson
Dr. Adena K. Berkowitz
Janet Dolgin
Carol Newman
Zelda R. Stern

Executive Director:

Marcy Serkin

Founding Donors:

Belda and Marcel Lindenbaum
Jewish Life Network/Steinhardt Foundation
The Harry Stern Family Foundation,
Harry & Cantor Deborah Stern &
Zelda Stern

JOFA JOURNAL is published quarterly by the Jewish Orthodox Feminist Alliance, a non-profit organization. Membership is \$36 per year, \$18 for students or seniors. All correspondence should be mailed to: Jewish Orthodox Feminist Alliance, 459 Columbus Avenue, Suite 329, New York, NY 10024. We can be reached by phone at: (212) 752-7133, fax at: (212) 753-6054, email at: jofa@rcn.com. See our website at www.jofa.org.

JOFA welcomes Dr. Sarah Mendlovitz as Coordinator of its Advocacy for Agunot Project. Please watch for our September issue for more information.

Bruchot Ha'baot

Continued from page 1

er often recites aloud a special blessing. In some Orthodox synagogues, it has become customary to name the child using both the mother's and the father's names.

- Women give introductory explanations before the reading of *megilot*.

- Women's *tefilla* groups are being increasingly offered space and made to feel welcome in Orthodox synagogues.

- Where structurally possible *mechitzot* (dividers) are being placed down the center of the syna-

gogue, with the *bimah* (lecturn) adjacent to the women's section.

- In some synagogues, the *shaliach tzibur* (prayer leader) recites the blessing *Shelo Assani Isba* silently.

- A man may request that he be called to the Torah not only using his father's name, but also his mother's name.

- Those being remembered in the memorial prayer *El Maleh* may be referred to as the child of both parents. ■

Note: For further clarification of these innovations and for *halakhic* references, please call the JOFA office at (212) 752-7133 or email jofa@rcn.com.

New and Noteworthy

Compiled by Abbie Gottesman

Los Angeles

On May 14 there was a mock trial to demonstrate the role of the *To'annot Halakha* (female rabbinical court advocates) when they appear before a *beit din* (court) in Israel. For more information or to discuss hosting such an event in your community, contact Robert Katz, executive director, Ohr Torah Stone, at (212) 935-8672.

New York

On June 4, Drisha hosted a pre-Shavout learn-in on the topic "Women in Leadership". This learn-in was open to women and men and was co-sponsored with Ma'yan: The Women's Project of the JCC on the Upper West Side. Additionally Drisha is running a three-week, full time June Institute and a five-week July Institute, as well as its regular part-time program. Contact Drisha at (212) 595-0307 or inquiry@drisha.org.

Israel

Congratulations to the Women of the Wall on their legal victory. After a twelve-year struggle, the Israeli Supreme Court reaffirmed the right of women to pray *halakhically* at the *Kotel* in a group. The Court ordered the government to set up a prayer schedule, with police protection, within six months and to determine the precise spot at the *Kotel* plaza where the women may pray. This is indeed a moment for rejoicing and a moment of prayer that the rift in the community will be healed.

Bar Ilan University is preparing to open an interdisciplinary graduate program in Gender Studies. The program will combine core courses as well as courses from social sciences, humanities, Jewish studies, and law and social policy. Additional faculty members specializing in gender studies are being sought. For information contact Professor Dafna Izraeli, Bar Ilan University, Ramat Gan, Israel. Fax 972-3-6-441-7459.

For the first time, a woman has been included in the higher level personnel of the Directorate of the Rabbinical Courts in Israel. Rachel Levmore, trained as a *to'enet rabbanit*, has been appointed to a position in the Directorate as coordinator for matters of *iggun* and *get* (divorce) refusal. This is a joint project of Kolech and the Council of Young Israel Rabbis in Israel, supported by the Jewish Agency for Israel. The courts refer divorce cases that have proven difficult to resolve to Ms. Levmore. Any *iggun* with a recalcitrant spouse residing in or visiting Israel can contact Ms. Levmore for assistance at the Directorate of the Israeli Rabbinical Courts. Tel: 972-2-658-2882, Fax: 972-2-651-5499.

On March 6, 2000 the *Knesset* passed a law stating that sanctions can be levied within prisons against incarcerated, recalcitrant spouses. Sanctions can include denial of mail, phone and visitation privileges and even solitary confinement. Until this law was passed, no judge, rabbinical or civic had jurisdiction over a prisoner inside the prison. These sanctions can now be levied in a legal as well as *halakhic* manner.

Abbie Gottesman studied at Pardes and at Nish'mat in Israel and is currently a member of the Board of Pardes and of JOFA.



Study and contemplation pervaded this year's Conference at the Grand Hyatt in New York.

A Woman's Place in the Synagogue Reviewing the *Halakha*

By Debby Koren

"I'm prepared to divide my *beit midrash* in half... my synagogue — never... Orthodox women should know that in the synagogue they're welcome guests, but they're guests."¹ While one should certainly appreciate the first part of the statement for the remarkable breakthrough that it is — equal access to the *beit midrash*, one is obliged to question the second part, women as guests in the synagogue. What is a guest? "A person who receives hospitality at another person's home or the hospitality of a club, a city or the like" (Webster's). A guest in the synagogue, then, is one who is not a partner or a member but is dependent upon the hospitality of others whose home or club the guest is visiting.

Women-as-guest in the synagogue is not the idiosyncratic view of the single prominent Orthodox rabbi who recently made the statement, but rather reflects the feelings of many others in the Orthodox community — rabbis and laymen and women themselves. Such an attitude stems from several sources: the exemption of women from obligations to pray with a *tzibbur* (community)², the social reality of women's place and work — the home, the relatively low Hebrew literacy of women until this century, women's choices to abide by a lesser liturgical obligation, men's encouragement to refrain from attending the synagogue³, *halakhic* opinions that menstruant women should not attend the synagogue⁴, and misconceptions and ignorance regarding women's liturgical obligations. No one would deny that women's attendance in the synagogue has been, and continues to be, limited in comparison to men's.

Yet the matter is not so simple. The increased educational levels of women and their increased performance of *mitzvot* (commandments), including prayer, as well as their broadened roles in other spheres of society, have prompted many to examine their relationship to prayer

in the synagogue and prayer with the *tzibbur*. A further prod to inquiry are the statements made by contemporary rabbis that would seem to require women's attendance in the synagogue. Interestingly, these statements are often made in the context of a condemnation of women's prayer groups, which take women out of the synagogue. For example, in critiquing women's prayer groups, the RIETS rabbis stated that by praying in the absence of a *minyan*, they (women) have forfeited the opportunity of *tefilla be-tzibbur* (public prayer) and of answering to *kaddish*, *barekhu* and the repetition of the *amida* with *kedusha*⁵. Another statement emphasizing the value of *tefilla be-tzibbur* for women is the following:

"... prayer, when recited in the presence of a *minyan* is of a different quality. The Talmud tells us that God guarantees that He will always listen to a prayer of a *minyan*. But when one prays individually without a *minyan*, one approaches God on one's own merits. He may listen or He may not. When one prays with a *minyan*, however, God always listens. Although a woman cannot participate in the formation of a *minyan*, when she does pray with one, her prayer is elevated to the status of *tefilla be-tzibbur*. One who chooses not to pray with a *minyan* makes a statement that he or she cares not whether God listens or does not listen to his or her prayer. It goes without saying that such a person has missed the essence of prayer and is obviously not motivated by proper religious intent. If prayer were taken seriously, it would be done in a way that would maximize its effectiveness."⁶

So, where is the contemporary Orthodox woman in all of this? Is she a "guest" or a part of this enterprise? Is it fair to criticize women for

not doing something that they are exempt from doing?

If I am not there, I am reckless regarding my prayers, but to be there is only at the grace of others and not by right. For answers we must turn to traditional sources. What does *halakha* say about the *beit kneset* (synagogue)? For whom is the synagogue built? To whom does it belong and what is a woman's place there? What is the value of *tzibbur*?

The Talmud is explicit about the value of prayer in the synagogue and about the value of communal prayer, where prayer in the synagogue even without a *tzibbur* is still better than prayer in another location, and prayer with the *tzibbur* is of the highest level:

Abba Binyamin said: A person's prayer is heard only in a *Beit Kneset*, as it is written, "to hear the joy and the prayer" (Kings I, 8). In the place where there is joy, there should be prayer.⁷

It is taught in a *beraita*: R. Natan says, from where do we learn that the Holy One blessed be He does not despise the prayers of the congregation, as it is said, 'God is indeed mighty and will not despise' (Job 36), and it is written 'Redeem my soul in peace from my conflicts, for the many were with me.' The Holy One, blessed be He, says, Anyone who occupies himself with Torah and with good deeds and prays with the *tzibbur*, I consider it as if he redeemed Me and My children from among the gentiles. Reish Lakish said, Anyone who has a *Beit Kneset* in his city and does not pray there is called a bad neighbor, ... Furthermore, he causes exile to himself and his children...⁸

Based on these and other statements in the *Gemara*, the Rambam, in codifying the laws of prayer, stated that the prayers of a *tzibbur* are always heard, even if there are sinners among them. For that reason a person (*adam*) should always join a *tzibbur* and not pray alone when

ever the person can pray with the *tzibbur*⁹. Note that the Rambam uses the term “*adam*”, a person; nowhere does he state that this doesn’t apply to women. This is striking in view of the fact that the Rambam is always careful in his writings to distinguish between men and women. Further, we know that the Rambam counts prayer as one of the 613 commandments and states that women are obligated in prayer at least once a day¹⁰. From the Rambam, therefore, we cannot conclude that women are exempt from this admonition to pray with a *tzibbur*. In fact, it would seem logical to conclude that anyone obligated in prayer (and this includes women and slaves) should abide by the Rambam’s admonition to pray with a *tzibbur*. However, overwhelmingly, *poskim* (*halakhic* decisors) absolve women from the obligation to pray with a *tzibbur*². Yet, as with any optional mitzvah, to do so is still of value, and still provides extra benefit and reward for the woman who does so.

Because of the value of prayer with a *tzibbur*, any place (i.e., city or village) that has ten (men) is required to build a house in which people will gather for prayer, and that place (i.e. house) is called a *beit kneset*¹¹. Even if a person is not able to pray with the *tzibbur*, it is preferable to pray in a *beit kneset*¹². The residents of a city must impose upon each other the building of the *beit kneset*, purchasing of a *sefer* Torah and the Prophets and Writings.¹³ These are community obligations, for the community, by the community, just as the building of a *mikveh*, or any other community need. This would be the same place that a woman would go to share the benefits of praying with a *tzibbur*. Just as she is a member of the community when using the *batei din* (the religious court system) and the *mikveh* (ritual bath), she is a member of the community regarding the use of the *beit kneset*.

In addition to attendance in the synagogue to pray with a *tzibbur* or to pray there privately, there are other *mitzvot* that a woman would perform in the synagogue. Though women were not initially obligated in the mitzvah of *shofar*, it is accepted that women have taken this mitzvah

upon themselves. There is no dispute today about the appropriateness of women taking upon themselves this obligation. Though theoretically a woman could fulfill this *mitzvah* outside of the synagogue, it is clearly most efficient to have women present in the synagogue when the *shofar* is blown and to fulfill this *mitzvah* at that time. When a woman needs to recite *birkat bagomel*, though she might assemble the required *minyan* outside of the synagogue, again, the most practical solution is to utilize the community facility known as the *Beit Kneset*, where she will undoubtedly find a *minyan*. Similarly, a woman, obligated in *kriyat hamegilla* (reading of the *megilla*) on Purim, might opt to join a *megilla* reading conducted outside of the synagogue, such as a women’s *megilla* reading. However, the phenomenon of women’s *megilla* readings is a very recent one and we can assume that throughout the centuries a woman’s most likely choice to hear the *megilla* was to attend the synagogue. Though it is not universal, some hold the opinion that women are obligated to hear *Parshat Zachor*. Again, attending the synagogue would be the natural way to perform this *mitzvah*. Many synagogues have customs that result in the use of the synagogue by women in the context of a community service. For example, in the Italian Jewish community, girls celebrating their Bat Mitzvahs would gather in the community synagogue, together with their family, friends, the congregation, and the Chief Rabbi. The ark would be opened and the girls would stand before the *sifrei* Torah and recite a special prayer.¹⁴

The synagogue should be viewed as a community facility, available to all members of the community, whatever their needs. We learn through the *machatzit hashekel* (the annual half *shekel*) that though only the non-Levite men over the age of 20 were obligated to give, the services rendered, such as purchasing animals for sacrifices to atone for the sins of all the nation, were rendered for the entire community, including the men under the age of 20, the Levites, and the women. Rabbi Avraham Yitzchak HaKohen

Kook explained in *Mishpat Cohen* (chapter 124) that there is a difference between a partnership and a community. In a partnership, every individual maintains part ownership, while in a community there is no individual possession. Public funds (including a public sacrifice) belong to the community, and all of the individuals belong to this community. The public sacrifices therefore belong to everybody and provide atonement for all. Similarly, the synagogue, built by the community, and the services of the *tzibbur*, composed of a *minyan* of men, are for the entire community, men and women.

Though the status of women as “guests” in the synagogue has its roots in tradition and historical behavior, the status of women as members of the community, utilizing the synagogue as a community facility has its basis in *halakhah*. Whether for the optional participation in communal prayer or for any of the other *mitzvot* performed in the synagogue that are obligatory upon women equally with men, the synagogue is a woman’s place. May all the women of Israel truly feel at home in every *beit kneset* within all of *Kneset Yisrael*. ■

Dr. Debby Koren is Director of Internet Technology at RAD Data Communications. She and her family live in Ra’anana, Israel.

¹ “Who’s Afraid of Orthodox Feminism”, Forward, February 25, 2000.

² Aryeh A. Frimer and Dov I. Frimer, *Women’s Prayer Services – Theory and Practice*, Tradition, Volume 32, No. 2, page 17. Note 85 provides an extensive list of sources for this point. Also, see Aryeh A. Frimer, *Women and Minyan*, Tradition, Volume 23, No. 4, page 56 and notes 26-29.

³ For example, in the *Iggeret haGra Livnei Beito*, the Vilna Gaon advised his daughter not to attend the synagogue.

⁴ See commentaries to Shulchan Aruch OH 88,1 and Mishnah Brurah 88,6.

⁵ This is from the teshuvah from the RIETS *Rashei Yeshiva* on Women’s prayer groups. Refer to note 75 in Aryeh A. Frimer and Dov I. Frimer, *Women’s Prayer Services – Theory and Practice*, Tradition, Volume 32, No. 2.

⁶ Moshe Meiselman, *The Rav, Feminism, and Public Policy: An Insider’s View*, Tradition, Volume 33, No. 1.

⁷ Brachot 6a

⁸ Brachot 8a

⁹ Rambam, *Mishneh Torah*, *Hilkhot Tefillah*, 8,1

¹⁰ Rambam, *Mishneh Torah*, *Hilkhot Tefillah*, 1,2

¹¹ Rambam, *Mishneh Torah*, *Hilkhot Tefillah*, 11,1

¹² Shulchan Aruch, OH 90,9

¹³ Rambam, *Mishneh Torah*, *Hilkhot Tefillah*, 11,1

¹⁴ Aharon Cohen, *Zevad Habat*, Kana, Jerusalem, 1990, p. 26.

Bless this Holy Congregation...

Continued from page 1

What do women seek in their spiritual lives and how do “synagogue” and “*daavening*”(prayer) figure in? Is “synagogue” different from “*daavening*”, the one pleasurable, the other of little consequence? At what age are young girls conditioned to a reality of second string player in prayer?

Does public policy or a “post *Shulkhan Aruch*” atmosphere take precedence over *halakhic* permissibilities? Who decides and how? What role does the *moreh d’atra* (leader of the congregation) play, the *gedolim* (great scholars), the board, the sisterhood, the religious committee, the *rebbezin*, the community’s women (not always identical with the sisterhood)? What are the parameters of women’s protest regarding *shul* culture? What can be done without rupturing synagogue

life and splintering the community?

Is women’s *tefilla* an interim solution or a long-term model? A paradigm of other his/her structures in the community? Why do most Orthodox women remain aloof? What is the role of men in women’s *tefilla*, *bat mitzvah*, baby naming and other *semachot* (joyful occasions)?

Does the congregational intern have a special role in communal *daavening*? In women’s *tefilla*? What will her position lead to or be limited to? To what extent is the place of Orthodox women in *shul* a microcosm for their general status in Orthodoxy? And what are the implications for family life as we begin to re-imagine women’s roles in the spiritual congregation?

These are questions we face, poised at the threshold of new era in which gender equality will be

increasingly integrated into Orthodox Judaism. Some answers will emerge from a conversation between laity and religious leadership; some will grow out of changes in the general culture that daily affect women’s self perceptions and longings; some will be answered by creating facts on the ground — the decision regarding the Women of the Wall has already begun to change minds and attitudes; and some questions may not be answered in our lifetimes.

None of this will be easy for when it comes to congregational prayer, the psyche, emotions and conditioning are forces as powerful as *halakhic* ones. Yet, we should welcome the evolutionary process that lies ahead, for on all sides it is about Jewish continuity and survival. For anyone concerned with the viability of Orthodoxy in the 21st century and beyond, refreshing the synagogue and the lives of men and women in it becomes a sacred task. ■

To order tapes of the Third International Conference on Feminism & Orthodoxy, or of the previous conferences, contact In-Phase at (914) 794-2222 or by fax at (914) 794-1211. Tapes are \$6.00 each.

JOFA Merchandise

Tee Shirt

Short sleeved, 100% cotton, white with “dancing women” logo on the chest pocket.

M and XL.....\$10.00

Baseball Cap

Canvas with embroidered “dancing women” logo on front.

Natural or Black.....\$12.00

Publications

“The Orthodox Jewish Woman and Ritual: Options and Opportunities” series. Titles available: Birth (20pp.), Shabbat (21pp.), Bat Mitzvah (21pp.), Death & Mourning (15pp.).

Contains sources for contemporary options for Orthodox women’s participation in these occasions, historical information, *t’khines* and bibliography.

\$5.00 Per book • \$18.00 Set of four books

Calendar

Full color, beautifully illustrated wall calendar containing images of both historical and contemporary Jewish women engaged in ritual, quotations, resources and important dates of interest.

Also includes candle lighting times and all holidays. September 2000 to September 2001. Shrink wrapped.....\$10.00

To order, please send your check to:

JOFA
459 Columbus Avenue
Suite 329
New York, NY 10024

Or visit our online store at www.jofa.org

Pinat Sefarim: The JOFA Book Corner

By Janet Dolgin

Allyse Fisher Roller describes her book, *The Literary Imagination of Ultra-Orthodox Jewish Women*, as an exercise in “cultural poetics.” Roller set out to examine the world of “ultra-Orthodox Jewish women” by examining the “literature” in English produced by such women. The project, she promises, will reveal “who these women are as well as what their literary contribution is.” Unfortunately, the book fulfills neither promise.

We do not learn much new about “who these women are” because Roller never clearly delineates and describes the essential assumptions that define the world she seeks to understand. She presents three “main theses”: that ultra-Orthodox women’s literature is a “reactionary...response to liberal feminist and Jewish feminist arguments”; that ultra-Orthodox women’s “literature”

offers a unique medium through which to understand these women, who have largely been misunderstood in “critical writing” about them; and that the “voice of *baalat teshuva* [returnees to Judaism] is distinct from the voice of women born into ultra-Orthodox homes. But she is more concerned with reiterating these theses than with looking carefully at the social and cultural implications of the writing she presents.

Moreover, Roller fails to establish the character of the “literary contribution” she considers. Much of the first half of the book focuses on literary criticism, secular women’s writing, and analytic studies of ultra-Orthodox women. When Roller turns to the creative literature of ultra-Orthodox women, the results are unimpressive. Chapters six through ten examine, in turn, personal narratives, anthologies, holocaust testimonials, self-help literature, and fiction. The array is

dizzying. Within a few pages Roller moves, without explanation—or organizational reason—from prosaic “poetry” about women braiding *challot* to deeply painful testimonials about the *shoa* (Holocaust) to a novel about a conflicted *baalat teshuva*. In each case, we learn more about the authors’ literary contributions and about their varied worlds from the excerpts Roller quotes than from Roller’s own commentary.

Roller deserves credit for imagining ultra-Orthodox women’s writing as a literary genre, fit for cultural analysis. Her project, however, is more impressive as imagined than as designed and actualized. ■

Janet Dolgin is a professor of constitutional law at Hofstra University School of Law, and she is an anthropologist as well as a lawyer. She and her family reside in West Hempstead, NY.

“May salvation arise from heaven — grace, kindness, compassion, long life...to this entire holy congregation, adults along with children, infants and women.”

—*Shacharit* for
Shabbat and Festivals

The ArtScroll *Siddur* notes: “This prayer is virtually identical to the previous one with one difference: This one refers specifically to the congregation with whom one is praying. Therefore it omits mention of national teachers and leaders, and it is written in the second person. It also mentions all segments of the congregation, young and old, man and woman, because it prays for the welfare of each member of the congregation.”



President Blu Greenberg and Alice Shalvi of Israel admire the magnificent seder display at the JOFA Conference.

Chairperson, Belda Lindenbaum and Scholar, Devorah Zlochower at a plenary session at the February 2000 International Conference on Feminism and Orthodoxy.



**Please join the Jewish Orthodox Feminist Alliance.
Fill out the information below and return coupon with your payment**

NAME: (Ms./Mr./Mrs./Rabbi/Dr.) _____

ADDRESS: _____

CITY: _____ STATE: _____ ZIP: _____

HOME PHONE: _____ WORK PHONE: _____

FAX: _____ E-MAIL: _____

ANNUAL DUES: ☐ \$36 ☐ \$18 (Students & Seniors)

ADDITIONAL CONTRIBUTION*: ☐ \$1,000 ☐ \$500 ☐ \$100 ☐ \$50 ☐ Other

*Any contribution beyond membership is tax-deductible.

Send all correspondence to: Jewish Orthodox Feminist Alliance, 459 Columbus Avenue, Suite 329, New York, NY 10024 jofa@rcn.com



Jewish Orthodox
Feminist Alliance
459 Columbus Avenue
Suite 329
New York, NY 10024

Change service requested

Non-Profit Org.
U.S. Postage
PAID
New York, NY
Permit No. 2208