

shema bekolah · hear her voice
שמע בקולה

The *Geulah* of Gerut:
Pesah as Transformation

by Erin Leib Smokler

Ronda Angel Arking, Editor

The Geulah of Gerut: Pesah as Transformation

by Erin Leib Smokler

The story of the Jewish enslavement in Egypt is repeatedly linked to exhortations about strangers (*gerim*) in the Torah. “Love the stranger,” Deuteronomy 10:19 tells us, “for you were strangers in the land of Egypt.” “You shall neither wrong a stranger, nor shall you oppress him,” warns Exodus 22:20, “for you were strangers in the land of Egypt.” Iterations of these sentiments feature no less than thirty-six times in the Torah, begging the questions: Why such repetitive emphasis, and why this connection between empathy and Egypt?

The relationship between the obligation to love a stranger and the experience of having been one seems linear enough. As Rabbi Natan says in Bava Metzia 59b, “Do not taunt your neighbor with the blemish that you yourself have.” Do not do unto others what was done to you. Do not render someone else an alien. Do not oppress a vulnerable person in your midst “כי גרים הייתם בארץ מצרים,” because you were once in that place of degradation. Let the pain of your personal past guide you toward a more compassionate future. Jewish history must yield Jewish obligation.

Insofar as our lowly origins ground our moral vision and our ethical mission for all time, retelling the story of the enslavement—on Pesah, and also throughout the year—becomes a central religious obligation. We start our tale in the thick of our misery, in “עבדים היינו,” to remind ourselves of the deep responsibility that was generated from our encounter with oppressive otherness.

Rabbi Yitzhak Hutner, however, in his book *Pahad Yitzhak*, suggests an alternative approach to

Erin Leib Smokler is pursuing a PhD in Philosophy and Religion at the University of Chicago’s Committee on Social Thought. She teaches Jewish Philosophy at the Drisha Institute for Jewish Education and holds an MA from the University of Chicago and a BA from Harvard University. Her writing has appeared in *The New Republic*, *The New York Times Book Review*, *The Jerusalem Report*, and *The New York Jewish Week*.

the centrality of the *ger* in our tradition generally and on Pesah specifically. Our experience with *gerut* in Egypt, he argues, refers not just to our status as strangers, but to our status as *gerim*, as actual converts. He writes:

יציאת מצרים הוי מעשה גירות כדחזינן ביבמות דכל
דיני גירות ילפינן מהתם

The Exodus was an act of conversion, as we see in Tractate Yevamot, as all of the laws of conversion are learned out from it. (*Pahad Yitzhak on Pesah, Essay 2*)

According to the Talmud, our ancestors initiated the process of conversion just before leaving Egypt. By the time they reached Sinai, but not before, they were full-fledged Jews. They had to undergo a series of transformative rituals—circumcision, immersion, and sacrifice—before they could receive revelation and definitively enter the covenant.

Rabbi Hutner’s claim is rooted in Yevamot 46a, which is itself codified by Maimonides in Mishneh Torah, Laws of Forbidden Intercourse 13:1–5.

- א. בשלושה דברים נכנסו ישראל לברית—במילה, ובטבילה, וקרבן.
- ב. מילה—היתה במצרים, כשנאמר “כל ערל לא יאכל בו” (שמות יב:מח). מל אותם משה רבנו, שכולם ביטלו ברית מילה במצרים, חוץ משבט לוי: ועל זה נאמר “ובריתך ינצורו” (דברים לג:ט).
- ג. וטבילה—היתה במדבר, קודם מתן תורה: כשנאמר “וקדשתם היום ומחר וכיבסו שמלותם” (שמות יט:י). וקרבן—כשנאמר “וישלח את נערי בני ישראל ויעלו עולות” (שמות כד:ה). על ידי כל ישראל הקריבום.
- ד. וכן לדורות, כשירצה הגוי להיכנס לברית, ולהסתופף תחת כנפי השכינה, ויקבל עליו עול תורה, צריך מילה וטבילה והרצאת קרבן: ואם נקבה היא, טבילה וקרבן: שנאמר “ככם כגר” (במדבר טו:טו). מה אתם במילה וטבילה והרצאת קרבן, אף הגר לדורות במילה וטבילה והרצאת קרבן.
- ה. ... ובזמן הזה שאין שם קרבן, צריך מילה וטבילה: וכשיבנה המקדש, יביא קרבנו.

1. Israel entered the covenant [with God] with three acts: circumcision, immersion, and offering a sacrifice.
2. Circumcision took place in Egypt, [before the Paschal sacrifice, of which Exodus 12:48] says: “No uncircumcised person shall partake of it.” Moses our teacher circumcised [the people].

For with the exception of the tribe of Levi, the entire [people] neglected the covenant of circumcision in Egypt. Regarding this, [Deuteronomy 33:9 praises the Levites,] saying: "They upheld Your covenant."

3. Immersion was performed in the desert before the Giving of the Torah, as [Exodus 19:10] states: "Sanctify them today and tomorrow, and have them wash their garments." Sacrifices [were also offered then], as [Exodus 24:5] states: "And he sent out the youth of the children of Israel and they brought burnt offerings." They offered them as agents of the entire Jewish people.
4. Similarly, for [all] future generations, when a Gentile desires to enter into the covenant, take shelter under the wings of the Divine presence, and accept the yoke of the Torah, he must undergo circumcision, immersion, and the offering of a sacrifice. A woman [who converts] must undergo immersion and bring a sacrifice, as [Numbers 15:15] states: "As it is for you, so shall it be for the convert." Just as you [entered the covenant] with circumcision, immersion, and the offering of a sacrifice; so, too, for future generations, a convert must undergo circumcision, immersion, and must bring a sacrifice.
5. ...In the present age, when there are no sacrifices, [a convert] must undergo circumcision and immersion. When the Temple is rebuilt, he must bring a sacrifice.

The story of the Exodus is thus the story of how every Jew became a Jew, so to speak. Lineage would not suffice to receive the Torah. Upon leaving Egypt, every individual had to choose to appropriate his or her inheritance. Everyone had to decide to take upon him or herself the burdens and the gifts of faith, and to enact this transformation. As Pirkei Avot 2:12 enjoins us, "התקן את עצמך לתלמוד תורה כי אינה ירושה לך" — "Prepare yourself for the study of Torah, for it is not an inheritance for you." The Torah, "מורשה קהילת יעקב" — "the heritage of the congregation of Jacob" (Deuteronomy 33:4)—was not and is not, in some essential way, a *ירושה*, a gift bestowed. One must prepare for it, work for it, become worthy of it. This is what *b'nei Yisrael* did as they exited Egypt. They took ownership over their Judaism by willfully choosing it.

This choice would form the basis of Jewish choices for all generations to come. As Maimonides emphasizes, quoting Numbers 15:15, "As are you,

so shall the *ger* be before the Lord." As we were converted, so should we convert others. The paradigm for spiritual transformation is our own. This is the lasting legacy of the Exodus.

In light of this, loving the *ger* takes on a whole new valence. We ought to embrace not only strangers, but also converts, "כי גרים הייתם בארץ מצרים," because we were all converts once. The foundational story of our people is a story of our own awakening to faith and commitment, and we must therefore humble ourselves before all who elect to join us on our ongoing journey.

* * *

The Pesah Haggadah instructs us:

בכל דור ודור חייב אדם לראות את עצמו כאילו הוא יצא ממצרים.

In each and every generation, a person is obligated to see herself as if she left Egypt.

Maimonides famously renders this as an obligation to show oneself, להראות, to be one who has left Egypt. What would it take to both see oneself as redeemed and to show oneself to be so?

Rabbi Hutner's reading of *gerut* adds a whole new dimension to this obligation. To exit Egypt, we now know, is to actively transform oneself as our ancestors did. It is to convert anew into a life freely chosen. It is to reaffirm one's commitments and to fortify one's faith. The claim embedded in the mitzvah of retelling the Exodus story is that that process is never ending. It must be told again and again, for it is so easily forgotten. Pesah after Pesah, we must see ourselves as capable of such choice. We must remember that we are not static beings lacking the possibility of growth and change. We can always become something new. On Pesah, we must also show ourselves to be transformed. Through intense preparations and festive Seder celebrations, we must externalize our commitments and vocalize our passions. We must demonstrate our willingness to actively engage with our tradition, to appropriate it as our own. In so doing, we announce ourselves to be *gerim* all over again, ones who have consciously and conscientiously taken on the Jewish tradition.

This, says Rabbi Hutner, is the essential message of Pesah and the significance of its timing as well. He writes:

...אין אנו מוצאים בכל ימות עולם הופעה של
 התחדשות בהנהגתו יתברך, כדרך שאנו מוצאים
 אותה בגאולת מצרים. הלא כל הלכות גירות נפקא לן
 מגאולת מצרים. משום שאז יצאו ישראל להכנס תחת
 כנפי השכינה. והלא שיא-פסגתה של כח ההתחדשות
 היא היא הגירות...דמכל הצדדים היתה גאולת מצרים
 הגילוי היותר ענקי לכח ההתחדשות בתולדות גוי
 ואדם. ופסוק בפני עצמו נתיחד לזה בתורה: "היום
 אתם יוצאים בחודש האביב." כלומר, היציאה היא
 בחודש ההתחדשות...דאביב היינו ההתחדשות...
 והעבודה זו של "כאילו הוא יצא" מזריחה בנו את כח
 ההתחדשות בכל עבודת השם שלנו שתהא נעשית
 אצלנו בכל יום ויום כחדשה...ולנצח תשאר גאולת
 מצרים האביב המובהק בכל דברי ימות עולם.

Nowhere in history do we find an instance of
 the renewal of God's leadership as we find in the
 redemption from Egypt. Behold, all of the laws
 of conversion are learned from the Exodus, for
 then the Israelites exited in order to enter under
 the wings of the Divine. And is not the apex of
 renewal conversion itself? ... From every angle, the
 Exodus was the greatest revelation of the power
 of renewal in the history of nations or people.
 There is a whole verse that attests to this in the
 Torah: "Today you are leaving, in the month of Aviv
 [spring]" [Exodus 13:4]. That is to say, the Exodus
 is in the month of renewal ... for spring is [about]
 renewal ... The practice of [seeing oneself] "as if
 one left [Egypt]" illuminates within us the power of
 renewal, such that all of our divine service can be
 made new again each and every day ... Forevermore
 the redemption from Egypt will stand as the most
 outstanding spring in history. (*Pahad Yitzhak* on
 Pesah, Essay 76, paragraph 16)

The story of the Exodus is the story of the rebirth
 of the Jewish people. It is the ultimate springtime
 tale of rejuvenation and redemption. But more than
 a tale, it is a learned practice: the practice of see-
 ing ourselves as converts, the practice of willful self-
 transformation. In the words of the poet Alexander
 Pope, "Hope springs eternal in the human breast;
 Man never Is, but always To be blest." In every gen-
 eration, and on every Pesah, a Jew must see herself
 as ever in the process of becoming a Jew.

Hag kasher v'sameah!

חג כשר ושמח

shema bekolah · hear her voice שמע בקולה

*This issue of Shema Bekolah is dedicated
 in honor of our mother and Savta,*

Sara Rosen

*on the occasion of her 85th birthday and in
 memory of our father and Saba,*

Joseph D. Rosen z"l

*Together they created a home imbued with the
 best of Judaism: respect for all men and women
 created b'tzelem elokim, tzedakah,
 and love of limmud Torah.*

**Mickey Rosen and Rabbi Karen L. Fox
 Avi and Benjy**

Rachel Rosen and Ron Wexler

Jesse, Ahuva and Shira

Itiya & Pinney Wolman

Anna and Naf Hanau



520 Eighth Avenue, Fourth Floor • New York, NY 10018

212-679-8500 • www.jofa.org

JOFA's mission is to expand the spiritual, ritual, intellectual, and political opportunities for women within the framework of *halakhah*. We advocate meaningful participation and equality for women in family life, synagogues, houses of learning, and Jewish communal organizations to the full extent possible within *halakhah*. Our commitment is rooted in the belief that fulfilling this mission will enrich and uplift individual and communal life for all Jews.